

Unraveling Capability & Capacity of Parallel Diplomacy Governance in Indonesia: How Far Are Indonesia's Regional Governments Ready to Go?

Windy dermawan¹, Gilang Nur Alam², Yusa Djuyandi³, Abdul Rauf Ridzuan⁴

Abstract

Nowadays, diplomatic practices are carried out by state actors and other actors, one of which is regional actors. Regional actors have now conducted international relations based on regional needs from various sectors. This phenomenon is common in mainland Europe, even the diplomatic practices carried out by regional actors have entered and developed in Indonesia. This can be reviewed through the governance of parallel diplomacy in Indonesia, built by legal aspects, parallelism, and implementation procedures. Even so, in practice, the capability and capacity of regional governments to carry out parallel diplomacy activities are one of the determinants of the success of regional diplomacy. This research aims to explore the capacity and capabilities of regional actors in Indonesia, both institutionally and personally, by referring to the Concept of Paradiplomacy (Parallel Diplomacy) and governance, Capability, and Capacity. Researchers use a qualitative approach through interviews with several relevant informants, internet-based research, documentation studies, and archival studies. This research found that the capacity and capabilities of regional actors in Indonesia in carrying out parallel diplomacy are still not evenly distributed and optimal. This can be seen through two aspects, namely the different amounts of budget funds and their management which is still less than optimal as well as limited knowledge of regulatory aspects of diplomatic practices by state civil servants in the regions.

Keywords: *Capability, Capacity, Governance, Regional Government (Pemerintah Daerah), Paradiplomacy (Parallel Diplomacy).*

Introduction

In 1961, state was the only actor with power in conducting international relations. This was marked by the signing of the Vienna Statute, which legitimized the power of state actors to do diplomacy (Siracusa, 2010). Until several years later, the power of state actors received various challenges from other actors, especially with the presence of massive globalization and the failure of state actors to prevent war and the emerging of terrorism (Wehrenfennig, 2008; Kuznetsov, 2015). Apart from the factors above, the role of state actors in running diplomacy service was also shifted by several new actors, such as MNCs, terrorist actors, IGOs, NGOs, and subnational actors.

Diplomatic activities managed by subnational actors (also known as parallel diplomacy) have actually been widely carried out in a number of developed countries, both in Europe, America, and Asia. For example, diplomacy done by the Catalan government in Spain, British Columbia, Nova Scotia, Quebec, Ontario (in Canada), Alberta, New York City, Houston (in the United States), to Tokyo and Hokkaido Province in Japan (Lachapelle & Paquin, 2005). In addition to being widely carried out in developed countries, the practice of parallel diplomacy has also developed in several developing countries, one of which is Indonesia.

The practice of diplomacy carried out by subnational actors (local governments) in Indonesia actually only started when the Soeharto Regime was in power. At that time, the central government had made regulations for local governments to be able to do foreign cooperation. Even so, the space for local governments in Indonesia is quite limited, considering that Indonesia is a unitary state (Mujiono, 2020). Furthermore, the practice of parallel diplomacy has been legally regulated through Act Number 24 of 2000 concerning International Agreements and Act Number 32 of 2004 relating to regional government (Pemerintah Daerah). Of course, the presence of this legal basis provides greater opportunities for local governments in

¹ Department of International Relations, Universitas Padjadjaran, Indonesia, Email: windy.dermawan@unpad.ac.id, (Corresponding Author)

² Department of International Relations, Universitas Padjadjaran, Indonesia.

³ Department of Political Sciences, Universitas Padjadjaran, Indonesia.

⁴ Universiti Teknologi MARA, Melaka, Malaysia.

Indonesia to develop their cooperation through parallel diplomacy (Mukti, 2015). Even now, the practice of parallel diplomacy is not only managed by provincial governments but also city/district governments.

Although parallel diplomacy in Indonesia has developed, in practice, Indonesia still faces several challenges. Diplomacy carried out by regional actors is still limited by several things that are procedural and administrative (technical) in nature (Surwandono & Maksum, 2020). This condition is what makes the optimization of regional government achievements in conducting diplomacy still narrow. In addition, Indonesia also still lacks regional government actors who implement their foreign relations, at least ceremonially. This can be seen through the lack of partnerships built by regional governments in Indonesia. This condition also shows the limitations of the capabilities and capacities of regional governments in Indonesia. Of course, the limitations of the diplomatic capabilities and capacities of each regional government also vary, and this is a problem in this research.

Then to support this research, researchers have created two typologies of previous studies to find novelty in this research. For the first typology, namely regional diplomacy, from several sources, such as Bursensa & Deforche (2010), Dickson (2014), Farmer & Stewart Fotheringham (2011), Halás et al. (2015), Lecours (2002), and Zarbaliyev (2017). Based on the literature study above, researchers found that there is parallel coordination between local governments and the central government in doing parallel diplomacy activities. Then for the second typology, researchers used several literature studies related to the study of parallel diplomacy governance, including from Mukti (2019), Liu & Song (2020), Vychodilová (2011), Schiavon (2018), Crikemans (2010), Dickson (2017), and Surwandono & Maksum (2020). Based on the literature study, researchers found that there were different perspectives in viewing the governance of parallel diplomacy itself. Some analysed it based on political institutions, the structure of parallel diplomacy opportunities, parallel diplomacy practices, and motives, goals, instruments, and at the level. However, in the literature study, there is still not much discussion about the capacity and capability of Indonesia's parallel diplomacy. Therefore, this research aims to explore the capabilities and capacities of local governments, both institutionally and personally, in the governance of Indonesian parallel diplomacy.

Methods

This research used a qualitative approach to understand a phenomenon, in this case the capability and capacity of regional diplomacy in the governance of Indonesian diplomacy. In other words, this qualitative approach facilitated this research in exploring and identifying the capability and capacity of regional diplomacy based on its function related to regional diplomacy (Nassaji, 2015). Then, in collecting relevant data, researchers used several indirect data collection techniques. This indirect data collection was carried out through internet-based research, documentation studies, and archival studies.

Moreover, after obtaining relevant data, researchers cross-checked using data triangulation techniques between primary data and secondary data as part of data validity (Denzin, 1978). After that, the validated data then became the subject of data analysis to understand the capabilities and capacities of regional actors in conducting their diplomacy. The three stages of data analysis used include: (1) the data reduction, (2) the data presentation, and (3) the conclusion making.

Literature Review

Paradiplomacy (Parallel Diplomacy)

The concept of paradiplomacy was first coined by Panayotis Saldatos, and this concept refers to the presence of subnational actors in the practice of international relations. Although they have the authority to establish international cooperation, these subnational actors still have parallels/connections with the central government (Crikemans, 2010).. The parallelism can refer to three things: (1) parallels related to joint coordination between subnational actors and the national government; (2) parallels related to complementary relationships between subnational actors and the national government; and (3) parallels in

the form of conflictual relationships between subnational actors and the national government (Duchacek, 2001).

The motivation of subnational actors to conduct their diplomacy is also influenced by several motives, such as economic, cultural, and political motives (Kuznetsov, 2015). Therefore, with the presence of opportunities for subnational governments to conduct their diplomatic activities, subnational governments can protect their own needs and interests (Duchacek, 2001). Furthermore, subnational governments perform various activities related to their paradiplomacy in various forms, such as: (1) establishing representative offices overseas; (2) conducting official visits represented by subnational governments; (3) doing comparative study activities to foreign countries; (4) holding trade and investment contacts; (5) establishing free trade zones; and (6) building participation in various opportunities in international forums (Duchacek, 2001).

In this research, researchers utilized the concept of parallel diplomacy as an analytical tool to analyse how diplomatic governance is carried out by local governments in Indonesia by referring to the aspects of the capabilities and diplomatic capacities of regional actors. On top of that, the concept of parallelism in the context of parallel diplomacy also assisted researchers in drawing the pattern of relations between regional actors and the central government in Indonesia in carrying out their diplomatic activities.

Governance, Capability, and Capacity

Governance is a series of processes consisting of planning, organizing, allocating resources, implementing, monitoring, and evaluating previously set goals (Sumadi & Ma'ruf, 2020). Additionally, the concept of governance itself is quite difficult to grasp with the various variations that exist so that there is no fixed definition. Even UNESCO also deals with this and states that governance can be subtle. However, governance itself can be simplified into two contexts: (1) the one that is related to the country's adaptability to its external environment, and (2) the context related to coordination and interaction between various parties, such as coordination and interaction done by the public-private sector, especially those related to policy networks (Pierre, 2000). The second context as coordination and interaction from Pierre (2000) is also supported by a citation, from Graham et al. (2003), which states that governance is an interaction between structure, process, and tradition. Also, this interaction will later determine how the power and responsibility of an actor can run—including the presence of citizen and policymaker interests in conveying their aspirations.

More broadly, the understanding of governance can refer to the structures, systems, and practices carried out by an organization in determining, monitoring, reporting decisions made, and using performance information to improve results (Canadian Audit & Accountability Foundation, 2020). Based on the description above, researchers conclude that there are at least three elements in governance itself, starting with the existence of a system, structure, and process. Ultimately, this research tries to reduce these three elements into four typologies of Indonesian parallel diplomacy governance, namely based on objectives or vision-mission, strategy or planning and development, policies or regulations, and programs performed by local governments as part of parallel diplomacy activities.

Further, the concepts used in this research are capability and capacity, both of which have fundamental differences. The concept of capacity itself refers to the resources owned by an actor in running a task. Meanwhile, the concept of capability itself reflects several things, ranging from knowledge to abilities used, developed, or improved to complete something (Global Health Index, 2021). Capability is also often interpreted as an effort to organize, implement, and control a system, such as government or companies, programs/projects, and so on, to achieve a goal (Appel-Meulenbroek & Danivska, 2021).

In the end, this research attempts to use the three concepts above to see how the capabilities and capacities of regional actors (which also include individual elements as regional diplomats) are in the governance of Indonesian diplomacy. This capacity can also be seen through the supply of resources and potential possessed by regional actors. This capability can be seen through the management of regional governments

(in the form of institutional frameworks) and also the capabilities of human resources within them (in the form of skills), which are very closely related to the success of diplomatic activities (Oddone, 2023).

Results

A Brief Picture of Indonesia's Diplomatic Governance: Central Government as Regulator and Local Ones as Executors

In seeing parallel diplomacy governance, researchers attempt to see it through the system, structure, and process. In addition, in this research, researchers try to provide a picture of Indonesia's parallel diplomacy governance based on the three elements: (1) the legal basis of Indonesia's parallel diplomacy, (2) the parallelism of regional and central governments, and (3) the procedures for parallel diplomacy itself. When viewed from a legal perspective, regional actors in Indonesia have actually been given space to conduct diplomatic activities based on Act Number 32 of 2004. In this regulation, the central government has given regional governments the freedom to conduct international relations in certain areas of cooperation (Mukti, 2013). Even long before this regulation came into effect, the central government had given regional governments the opportunity to conduct foreign relations, as stated in Act Number 37 of 1999 (Article 23), as follows:

“Implementation of stipulations as laid down in Articles 21 and 22 shall be carried out through cooperation with the local government or the relevant government of other countries or international organizations.”

Despite having the freedom in terms of international cooperation, local governments in Indonesia still have limited space to maneuver in conducting their diplomatic activities, where local governments are still bound by Jakarta's interests. This is indeed inseparable from the so-called right to decentralization. On the one hand, this right to decentralization provides space for local governments to manage their regions based on the needs of each region. However, on the one hand, the regional needs referred to above must be in line with Indonesia's national interests. Therefore, the Indonesian government through its Ministry of Foreign Affairs has implemented several specific regulations so that diplomatic activities carried out by regional actors remain in line with national interests.

The emergence of the fulfilment of parallelism of regional needs with national interests can be referred to Act Number 23 of 2014 concerning regional government. Article 363 Paragraph 1 states that the objectivity of holding all forms of regional cooperation, including international cooperation, is aimed at improving people's welfare—as one of the national interests. In fact, the potential possessed by each region in Indonesia can become a bargaining position for national diplomacy. With the spotlight on this parallelism, researchers can conclude that structurally, regional governments have the same level as the central government. This condition is reflected through the relationship between the two as a relationship between equal public bodies. Nevertheless, the position of regional governments in Indonesia is still subordinate (Hoessein, 2001). In other words, regional governments still depend on the central government through parallel relationships, although in terms of level it is not hierarchical.

Local governments in Indonesia are able to adjust their demands to national interests and the direction of the country's foreign policy in a number of sectors due to the parallelism in noncentral-central ties. The sectors of cooperation that are legally permitted are then regulated in detail through the Regulation of the Minister of Foreign Affairs Number 09/A/KP/XII/2006/01, as follows: (1) Cooperation in the economic sector, which includes several sub-sectors of cooperation, including trade, investment, employment, maritime affairs and fisheries, science and technology, forestry, agriculture, population, tourism, environment, and transportation; (2) Cooperation in the socio-cultural fields, which includes education, health, youth, women's affairs, sports, and the arts (Departemen Luar Negeri, 2003).

Later, in addition to being seen through legal aspects, the governance of Indonesian parallel diplomacy can also be seen through the procedures or flow of implementing parallel diplomacy itself. The procedures for implementing parallel diplomacy by regional governments have also been well regulated through existing regulations, such as in the Regulation of the Minister of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia No. 09/A/KP/XII/2006/01 concerning General Guidelines for Procedures for Foreign Relations and

Cooperation by Regional Governments and Regulation of Minister of Home Affairs (Peraturan Menteri Dalam Negeri) Number 3 of 2008 concerning Guidelines for the Implementation of Regional Government Cooperation with Foreign Parties. The flow of implementing diplomatic activities carried out by regional actors in Indonesia includes at least several stages, as follows (Mukti, 2013): (1) The planning stage, which includes the stage of preparing materials and descriptions to be carried out by the local government, including in selecting potential external actors; (2) Stage of establishing communication with external actors, including preparing the Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) to cooperation materials; (3) Stage of submitting an MoU between the local government and a foreign local government or with a foreign actor through the Ministry of Foreign Affairs; (4) Stage of discussing the plan in detail to obtain Regional House of Representative (DPRD) approval; (5) Stage of officially signing the cooperation contract with the foreign actors.

Based on the explanation above, it can be seen that subnational actors, with their capacity as regional government actors, do have the authority to carry out foreign cooperation through parallel diplomacy. This can be seen from the existence of several regional apparatuses who are directly involved in executing this diplomatic activity, such as the governor, deputy governor, Regional House of Representative (DPRD), and several regional government apparatuses related to the field of cooperation being carried out (Thontowi, 2009). However, the procedures for diplomatic activities above also show that the central government has encouraged a one-door policy to prevent problems between regional parties and foreign parties. In other words, the central government (through its Ministry of Foreign Affairs) only acts as a regulator.

Additionally, based on the explanation above, the governance of Indonesia's parallel diplomacy in general can be seen through three things. First, the legal basis for knowing the governance system of Indonesia's parallel diplomacy has laws to regulate the international relations activities of regional actors in detail. Second, the governance of Indonesia's parallel diplomacy can also be reviewed through the aspect of parallelism, which also shows a picture of the structure of parallel diplomacy as well as a picture of the pattern of relations between the regional government and the central government. Third, the governance of Indonesia's parallel diplomacy can be seen through its implementation as part of the process of governance of regional diplomacy itself, by involving various parties, starting from the regional government as the main actor, external parties (as cooperation partners), to the regional legislative body (DPRD).

Parallel Diplomacy Governance in Indonesia: Off to A Roaring Start?

Departing from the previous governance of Indonesian parallel diplomacy, researchers see that the three aspects of parallel diplomacy governance have become a foothold for regional actors in carrying out their diplomatic activities; at least it can be seen through four typologies, including the vision and mission of the regional government, strategies carried out by the regional government, regulations/policies taken, and implementation of programs implemented by regional actors. Furthermore, researchers will examine the four typologies through several examples of regional actors, such as the provincial governments of West Java, Bali, Bengkulu, West Sumatra, and the city of Bandung.

Legally, regional actors in Indonesia certainly have rules based on legislation, including the vision, mission, and objectives of the region—especially in conducting foreign cooperation. For example, in the West Java Regional Regulation Number 9 of 2010 concerning the implementation of regional cooperation, the intent and purpose of the cooperation are stated in detail, namely to realize sustainable development in West Java by utilizing and empowering existing potential. Then in Article 3, the objectives of the cooperation held by the West Java government are also explained, including: (1) to improve public services, (2) to establish strategic partnerships in the regional development process, (3) to overcome problems in the regional development process and provide an impact on the community, in the form of welfare, (4) to empower existing potential, (5) to optimize benefits and mutual advantages, (6) to create harmony, compatibility, and integration in various stages of development, (7) to empower the potential of human resources, natural resources, and also technology for the common interest, (8) to seek alternative financing for development activities outside the local government budget (APBD), and (9) to increase the effectiveness and efficiency of the flow of provision, exchange, and also development of information (Peraturan Daerah Provinsi Jawa Barat Nomor 9 Tahun 2010, 2011). With the above objectives, the West Java Provincial Government can

map out its plans for carrying out its international relations activities according to regional needs and national interests. Apart from West Java, the Bali and Bengkulu provincial governments have also done the same thing.

Legally, regional actors in Indonesia certainly have rules that are based on legislation, including regional visions and missions and goals—especially in managing foreign cooperation. For example, in West Java Regional Regulation Number 9 of 2010 concerning the implementation of regional cooperation, the aims and objectives of holding cooperation are stated in detail, namely to realize sustainable development in West Java by utilizing and empowering existing potential. Then in Article 3, the objectives of the collaboration by the West Java government are also explained, including; (1) to improve public services, (2) to establish strategic partnerships in the regional development process, (3) to overcome existing problems in the regional development process and provide an impact on the community, in the form of prosperity, (4) to empower existing potential, (5) to optimize benefits and mutual benefits, (6) to create harmony, harmony and integration in various stages of development, (7) to empower the potential of human resources, natural resources and technology for the common good, (8) to seek alternative financing for development activities outside the local government budget (APBD), and (9) to increase the effectiveness and efficiency of the flow of provision, exchange and development of information (Peraturan Daerah Provinsi Jawa Barat Nomor 9 Tahun 2010, 2011). With the basic objectives above, the West Java Provincial government can map out its plans for carrying out its international relations activities in accordance with regional needs and national interests. Apart from West Java, the provincial governments of Bali and Bengkulu have also done the same thing.

The Bali Provincial Government has even regulated more specific cooperation, which is based on regional needs. One of them, we can see in Bali Governor Regulation Number 80 of 2022 concerning the implementation of regional innovation, is that the Bali government has encouraged cooperative activities to achieve innovation development. Likewise with the Bengkulu provincial government, especially in achieving the objectives of the environmental protection and management plan (RPPL), the Bengkulu government encourages international cooperation activities with foreign institutions or regional governments through Regional Regulation Number 2 of 22.

Based on the presence of objectives depend on clear laws, local governments in Indonesia can create a strategy or plan based on the local go government medium-term (RPJMD)—which is a derivative of the local long-term development plan (RPJPD)—as a basis for implementing development in a five-year period. Through this plan, local governments can also see the potential and opportunities that can be developed to carry out parallel diplomacy activities. In addition to the presence of potential mapping, through this regional development plan, local governments can design a policy, including in collaborating with various parties to support their regional goals. Starting from here, various programs related to regional government diplomacy activities originate.

Local governments in Indonesia can formulate a plan or strategy based on local go government medium-term (RPJMD), a five-year plan that is derived from the local long-term development plan (RPJPD), provided that the objectives are supported by specific legislation. Local governments are also able to understand the possibilities and potential for conducting parallel diplomacy through this RPJMD. Local governments can create a policy using this RPJMD, including working with other parties to promote their regional goals, in addition to the possibility of mapping. Numerous programs pertaining to regional government diplomacy initiatives start here.

Diplomatic activities conducted by regional actors are certainly very diverse. This diversity can be seen based on issues or types/forms, such as ceremonial paradiplomacy, sister province, sister city, and others. Of the many regional governments in Indonesia, the West Java Provincial Government is the regional actor that is most active in carrying out regional diplomacy activities. It is recorded that there are eight countries that have become West Java's cooperation partners (Suhendrik, Affandi, & Sari, 2021). The following are some of West Java's programs that are included in diplomatic activities, including: (1) the Global Youth Summer Camp Program with the Gyeongsangbuk regional government, South Korea; (2) the English for Ulama program with the British government; (3) a cultural cooperation program with the Southern

Australian government; (4) an oxygen cylinder procurement program with the Guanxi Zhuang government; and many others (Putri, 2023; Sari, 2018; Antara, 2023; Ramadani, Wijaya, & Mastuti, 2020).

In addition to West Java, the West Sumatra Provincial Government is also quite active in organizing various programs related to parallel diplomacy. For example, in 2023, the West Sumatra government opened a Korean language class for its people as part of the sister city cooperation with the Jeollabuk regional government (South Korea). Moreover, West Sumatra and Jeollabuk collaborated in tourism and agriculture (Setyo, 2023; Sekretariat Pemprov Sumbar, 2023). Unlike most regional governments that target developed countries as their cooperation partners, the Bali Provincial Government actually signed foreign cooperation with regional governments from developing countries, namely the Ho Chi Minh government. The cooperation between the two was initiated by the desire of the two regional governments to increase tourist visits through the sister province program. In addition, this program also intended to boost the community's economy (Wardani, 2021).

On top of collaborating with local government actors, several regions in Indonesia have also collaborated with foreign institutions. As was done by the Bengkulu government, through the regional-owned enterprise (BUMD), PT Bengkulu Mandiri, which signed a cooperation agreement with one of the Italian business institutions, Roma Capitale Investment Foundation. This cooperation was launched to develop the economic sector, especially in the agricultural sector (Harapan Baru News, 2024). Furthermore, there have also been several cases of failed diplomacy, such as the sister city cooperation between the City of Bandung and the City of Namur, a Belgian municipality. The cooperation between the two focused on the scope of technology, information, and public services, especially in the development of smart cities and halal tourism. The ineffectiveness of the cooperation between the City of Bandung and the City of Namur itself was caused by several things, including the lack of readiness of the Bandung community (as human resources) in utilizing smart city supporting facilities properly to the implementation of halal certificates that did not run properly (Rifa'i, 2024).

Based on the explanation above, researchers can find that the governance of diplomacy at the regional level has been in accordance with the governance expected by the central government. Even so, diplomatic activities carried out by regional governments in Indonesia are also influenced by the capabilities (management) and capacity (resources) of each regional government. With good capacity and capability, of course, the diplomatic activities carried out will be more optimal. This was agreed by the central government in Jakarta: there are at least three problems that hinder regional governments in carrying out their foreign cooperation, ranging from the lack of human resource capabilities to the lack of coordination and follow-up in the implementation of parallel diplomacy itself. These three problems are part of the capacity and capabilities of regional actors which inhibit the growth of regional government's diplomacy (Dwijayanti & Gurusinga, 2023).

Capability and Capacity of Indonesia's Regional Actors in Parallel Diplomacy: The Fuel of the Actors to Step Further

Apart from technical matters, such as procedures, parallel diplomacy governance also challenges the situation and conditions of the local governments. These situations and conditions are also directly related to the capacity (resources) and capabilities (managerial aspects) of regional actors. The capacity of regional actors in Indonesia can be seen through several aspects, starting from sources of funds and human resources (including knowledge and skills possessed) to the potential that can be developed through parallel diplomacy activities. Then for the capability itself, researchers can analyse it through several things, including the rules for organizing parallel diplomacy, special bureaus/agencies, and the procedures for implementing diplomacy itself. Both capacity and capability are interrelated aspects.

A crucial aspect in the capacity of regional diplomacy management is the source of funds. Starting from sufficient sources of funds, regional governments can at least develop the potential of their natural resources and human resources more optimally to support every diplomatic activity. Talking about regional budgets/income, regional governments themselves receive funds from several sources, including local own-source revenue (Pendapatan Asli Daerah) which is obtained from regional taxes, regional levies, and the results of managing regional wealth), balancing funds, and others. In spite of the budgets owned by

provincial governments vary. For example, West Java has a budget of IDR 35,918.61 billion for 2024. This figure is very different from the budget owned by West Sumatra, which pockets IDR 6,586.58 billion—this number is slightly more than the budget owned by the Bali government, which is IDR 6,354.20 billion (Direktorat Jenderal Perimbangan Keuangan Kemenkeu RI, n.d.).

Then, in practice, local governments still cannot manage the existing budget optimally. This is evidenced by the deficit number for the local government budget (APBD), especially at the provincial level, which reached IDR 444.52 billion as of 2017 (Direktorat Jenderal Perimbangan Keuangan, 2017). Based on the findings above, researchers concluded that the capacity and capability of budget management in each region is not evenly distributed and not optimal yet. This condition also shows the managerial capabilities of regional institutions that are still lacking.

Additionally, institutional capabilities can also be reviewed from the aspect of coordination and also the sustainability of parallel diplomacy itself. In other words, capabilities in organizing and implementing procedures also determine the success of regional actors. For the coordination aspect itself, the regional government ideally has a special agency or bureau to handle international cooperation. For example, the West Java government has a cooperation bureau, which is under the coordination of the Assistant for Government, Law, and Social Welfare of West Java to manage the coordination of West Java's cooperation with external parties (Peraturan Gubernur Jawa Barat, 2020).

Likewise, the province of Bali has a special bureau, a cooperation sub-section, which is under the Bureau of Government and Public Welfare, especially the government affairs section (Peraturan Gubernur Bali, 2021). Although under the auspices of different agencies, the governments of West Sumatra and Bengkulu Provinces also have their own cooperation sections, namely the Bureau of Cooperation, Development, and Rantau (West Sumatra), which is under the Assistant for Economy, Development, and Public Welfare, and the General Government and Cooperation sub-section under the Government Affairs Section, Assistant for Government and Public Welfare (for Bengkulu Province) (Peraturan Gubernur Sumatera Barat, 2017; Peraturan Gubernur Bengkulu, 2020). The presence of a special bureau or agency in the governance of parallel diplomacy at the provincial level above also shows that institutional capabilities in terms of coordination and implementation of diplomacy itself are quite good.

Although the good institutional capabilities are not accompanied by good personal capabilities and capacities. Surprisingly the Indonesian Cabinet Secretariat has highlighted this, where the understanding of the apparatus managing paradiplomacy in Indonesia is still limited, especially the understanding of management, regulations, and the process of its mechanisms (Dwijayanti & Gurusinga, 2023). This is reflected in the Bengkulu coffee diplomacy activities, where regional officials still do not understand parallel diplomacy due to the lack of information about this. The lack of information is also supported by the existence of an old-fashioned understanding that diplomacy can only be done by state actors. The lack of human resource capacity who understands this diplomacy certainly causes technical capabilities in implementing diplomacy to also be affected (Putradiansyah, 2024). Sure, in addition to information and training for regional officials about parallel diplomacy, strengthening the implementation of tasks and functions of regional cooperation must also be improved. Then, no less importantly, there must be strengthening of functions and coordination with Indonesian representatives abroad to bridge existing opportunities (Dwijayanti & Gurusinga, 2023).

Conclusion

The practice of paradiplomacy in Indonesia actually began to enter during the New Order era. At that time, the governance of parallel diplomacy in Indonesia began to form with the existence of legislation that allowed local governments to conduct international relations. Furthermore, this governance was also supported by the presence of a stable structure and parallel relations between local governments and the central government. Through clear laws, local governments were also given systematic guidance in the process. However, in practice, diplomatic activities carried out by local governments in Indonesia are still not optimal. This is related to the different capacities and capabilities of actors, such as different budgets,

which are later related to the optimization of the management and implementation of diplomacy itself. Even in some regions, the capabilities of regional apparatus are still lacking, where knowledge of parallel diplomacy is still not widely known, even at the provincial level. In addition to showing the institutional management aspect that is still lacking, this condition also shows the lack of personal capabilities in building a climate of parallel diplomacy that is not yet ready. Of course, with the presence of this research, it is hoped that it can be a recommendation for the central government and regional governments to continue to develop their diplomatic activities, especially in terms of capacity and capability, both institutionally and personally.

References

- Antara. (2023, Juli 6). Jabar komitmen perpanjang "Sister Province" dengan Guangxi Zhuang. Retrieved from Antara News: <https://www.antaraneews.com/berita/3622953/jabar-komitmen-perpanjang-sister-province-dengan-guangxi-zhuang>
- Criekemans, D. (2010). Introduction. In D. Criekemans, *Regional Sub-State Diplomacy Today* (pp. 1-2). Leiden: Martinus Nijhoff Publishers.
- Denzin, N. K. (1978). *The Research Act A Theoretical Introduction to Sociological Methods*. New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company.
- Departemen Luar Negeri. (2003). *Panduan Umum Tata Cara Hubungan Luar Negeri oleh Pemerintah Daerah*. Jakarta: Direktorat Perjanjian Ekonomi dan Sosial Budaya.
- Direktorat Jenderal Perimbangan Keuangan. (2017). *Ringkasan Anggaran Pendapatan dan Belanja Daerah*. Jakarta: Kementerian Keuangan.
- Direktorat Jenderal Perimbangan Keuangan Kemenkeu RI. (n.d.). Retrieved from Direktorat Jenderal Perimbangan Keuangan Kemenkeu RI: <https://djpk.kemenkeu.go.id/portal/data/apbd?periode=7&tahun=2024&provinsi=22&pemda=00>
- Duchacek, I. D. (1984). The International Dimension of Subnational Self-Government. *The Journal of Federalism*, 6-31.
- Duchacek, I. D. (2001). Perforated Sovereignties: Towards a Typology of New Actors in International Relations. Dalam H. J. Michelmann, & P. Soldatos, *Federalism and International Relations: The Role of Subnational Units* (hal. 32). Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Dwijayanti, R., & Gurusinga, A. L. (2023, April 1). Memaksimalkan Kerja Sama Pemerintah Daerah dengan Pihak Luar Negeri. Retrieved from Sekretariat Kabinet Republik Indonesia: <https://setkab.go.id/memaksimalkan-kerja-sama-pemerintah-daerah-dengan-pihak-luar-negeri/>
- Global Health Index. (2021). Defining Preparedness, Capacity, and Capability. Retrieved from Ghsindex: <https://ghsindex.org/news/defining-preparedness-capacity-capability/>
- Harapan Baru News. (2024, Juni 4). Investor Italia dan BUMD Bengkulu Jalin Kerja Sama Garap Potensi Bumi Raflesia. Retrieved from Harapan Baru News: <https://harapanbarunews.com/investor-italia-dan-bumd-bengkulu-jalin-kerja-sama-garap-potensi-bumi-raflesia/>
- Hoessein, B. (2001). Hubungan Kewenangan antara Kepala Daerah dan Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Daerah dalam Penyelenggaraan Otonomi Daerah.
- Kuznetsov, A. S. (2015). *Theory and Practice of Paradiplomacy: Subnational governments in international affairs*. Oxon: Routledge.
- Mujiono, D. (2020, Juli 21). Mengenal Paradiplomasi: Sejarah dan Implementasinya di Indonesia. Diambil kembali dari Kompas: <https://nasional.kompas.com/read/2022/07/21/16385771/mengenal-paradiplomasi-sejarah-dan-implementasinya-di-indonesia>
- Mukti, T. A. (2013). *Paradiplomasi: Kerjasama Luar Negeri oleh PEMDA di Indonesia*. Yogyakarta: The Phinisi Press Yogyakarta.
- Mukti, T. A. (2015). Paradiplomacy: Bangkitnya Aktor Lokal di Fora Internasional. *The POLITICS: Jurnal Magister Ilmu Politik Universitas Hasanuddin*, 1, 85-94.
- Nassaji, H. (2015). Qualitative and descriptive research: Data type versus data analysis. *Language Teaching Research*, 19, 129-132.
- Oddone, N. (2023). *Paradiplomacy*. Oxford University Press. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1093/acrefore/9780190846626.013.797>
- Paquin, S. (2020). Paradiplomacy. In T. Balzacq, F. Charillon, & F. Ramel, *Global Diplomacy An Introduction to Theory and Practice* (p. 57). Cham: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Peraturan Daerah Provinsi Jawa Barat Nomor 9 Tahun 2010. (2011, Oktober). Peraturan Daerah Provinsi Jawa Barat Nomor 9 Tahun 2010. Diambil kembali dari BPK Perwakilan Provinsi Jawa Barat: <https://jabar.bpk.go.id/files/2011/10/Perda-No.9-Tahun-2010.pdf>
- Peraturan Gubernur Bali. (2021, Januari 20). Peraturan Gubernur Bali Nomor 2 Tahun 2021. Retrieved from Database Peraturan BPK : <https://peraturan.bpk.go.id/Details/182138/pergub-prov-bali-no-2-tahun-2021>
- Peraturan Gubernur Bengkulu. (2020, Februari 14). Peraturan Gubernur Bengkulu Nomor 1 Tahun 2020. Retrieved from Database Peraturan BPK : <https://peraturan.bpk.go.id/Details/162603/pergub-prov-bengkulu-no-1-tahun-2020>
- Peraturan Gubernur Jawa Barat. (2020). Peraturan Gubernur Jawa Barat Nomor 82 Tahun 2020. Diambil kembali dari JDIIH Provinsi Jawa Barat: <https://jdih.jabarprov.go.id/page/info/produk/25285?tentang=peraturan-gubernur-jawa-barat-nomor-82-tahun-2020-tentang-kedudukan-dan-susunan-perangkat-daerah-provinsi-jawa-barat>

- Peraturan Gubernur Sumatera Barat. (2017). Peraturan Gubernur Sumatera Barat Nomor 89 Tahun 2017. Retrieved from Database Peraturan BPK: <file:///C:/Users/MyBook%20Hype/Downloads/PERGUB%20NO%2089%20TAHUN%202017%20ttg%20PERUBAHAN%20ATAS%20PERGUB%20NO%2068%20THN%202016%20TTG%20KEDUDUKAN,%20SUSUNAN%20ORGANISASI,%20TUGAS%20DAN%20FUNGSI%20SERTA%20TATA%20KERJA%20SEKDA%20PROV%20SUMBAR.pdf>
- Pierre, J. (2000). Introduction: Understanding Governance. In J. Pierre, *Debating Governance: Authority, Steering, and Democracy* (pp. 1-10). New York : Oxford University Press.
- Putradiansyah, N. R. (2024). Kandaga Unpad. Retrieved from Paradiplomasi Bengkulu dalam Pengembangan Potensi Kopi Bengkulu.
- Putri, I. (2023, September 2). Jabar-Korsel Perkuat Sinergi Lewat Sister Province, Ini Dampaknya. Retrieved from Detik News: <https://news.detik.com/infografis/d-6908981/jabar-korsel-perkuat-sinergi-lewat-sister-province-ini-dampaknya#:~:text=Jakarta%20%2D%20Pemerintah%20Provinsi%20Jawa%20Barat,sederet%20manfaat%20bagi%20kedua%20negara.>
- Ramadani, I., Wijaya, M. E., & Mastuti, S. (2020). A Critical Analysis of English for Ulama Program: A Collaboration Between West Java Local Government and British Council Indonesia. *Jurnal Kebijakan & Administrasi Publik*, 24, 95-113.
- Rifa'i, A. A. (2024, Juni 25). Kegagalan Kerjasama Sister City antara Kota Bandung dengan Kota Namur. Retrieved from Kumparan: <https://kumparan.com/andika-aziz-rifai/kegagalan-kerjasama-sister-city-antara-kota-bandung-dengan-kota-namur-230KWcCabar/full>
- Sari, S. (2018). Revitalisasi Kerjasama Sister Province Jawa Barat dengan Negara Bagian Australia Selatan. *Jurnal Dinamika Global*, 3(1), 41-50. doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.36859/jdg.v3i01.55>
- Sekretariat Pemprov Sumbar. (2023, February 22). Biro Adpim Pemerintah Provinsi Sumatera Barat. Retrieved from Gubernur Mahyeldi Minta LOI dengan Provinsi di Korea segera Ditindaklanjuti menjadi MOU: <https://biroadpim.sumbarprov.go.id/home/news/341-gubernur-mahyeldi-minta-loi-dengan-provinsi-di-korea-segera-ditindaklanjuti-menjadi-mou>
- Setyo, D. (2023, November 30). Kursus Bahasa Korea Kerjasama Jeollabuk do Sumbar Luluskan 60 Peserta. Retrieved from Radio Republik Indonesia: <https://www.rri.co.id/hiburan/464212/kursus-bahasa-korea-kerjasama-jeollabuk-do-sumbar-luluskan-60-peserta>
- Siracusa, J. M. (2010). *Diplomacy: a Very Short Introduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Suhendrik, Affandi, R. N., & Sari, D. S. (2021). Paradiplomasi Jawa Barat terhadap Provinsi Sichuan dalam Menanggulangi Pandemi Covid-19 di Jawa Barat. *Jurnal Transborders*, 5, 56.
- Surwandono, S., & Maksum, A. (2020). The Architecture of Paradiplomacy Regime in Indonesia: A Content Analysis. *Jurnal Politik Internasional*, 22(1), 77-99. doi:[10.7454/global.v22i1.443](https://doi.org/10.7454/global.v22i1.443)
- Thontowi, J. (2009). Kewenangan Daerah Dalam Melaksanakan Hubungan Luar Negeri (Studi Kasus di Propinsi Jawa Barat dan DIY). *Jurnal Hukum IUS QUIA IUSTUM*, 149-168. doi:<https://doi.org/10.20885/iustum.vol16.iss2.art1>
- Wardani, D. K. (2021). Paradiplomasi Pemerintah Provinsi Bali Untuk Sister Province Bali Dengan Ho Chi Minh Di Bidang Pariwisata. *Review of International Relations*, 3(1), 1-22. doi:<https://doi.org/10.24252/rir.v3i1.22429>
- Wehrenfennig, D. (2008). Multi-Track Diplomacy and Human Security. *Human Security Journal*, 7, 80-89.